



University of Montana

Biological Sciences, Department of Zoology • Missoula, Montana 59812-1201 • (406) 243-5122

16 June 1988

Dr. Leo Marnell
Glacier National Park
P. O. Box 343
West Glacier, MT 59936

Dear Leo,

The purpose of this letter is to inform you of the results of our analysis of the fish that we collected from a hybrid swarm of westslope and Yellowstone cutthroat trout in Fish Lake last year. We caught 1 fish by angling and 29 fish with experimental gill nets on 6 September 1987. We exceeded our limit by 5 because we caught an unexpected total of 10 fish on our last set of the nets. The attached Table 1 presents the length, weight, condition factor, sex, and age of each fish collected.

This work is part of the dissertation research of Steve Forbes. I have enclosed a copy of his dissertation proposal which describes the objectives of his research and summarizes the results to date. Steve's results are based on samples from three populations of westslope X Yellowstone hybrid swarms: Fish Lake, Cataract Creek (a tributary of the Vermilion River in the lower Clark Fork drainage), and Forest Lake (Lewis and Clark National Forest).

I believe this is fundamentally important research. In addition, Steve's results have dramatically changed our view of hybrid swarms of trout in ways that have important management implications.

The most important result is that the frequency of Yellowstone genes has increased significantly in all three populations. We can see this by comparing Steve's results to the results of the 1979 sample from Fish Lake (see attached Table 2). Five loci were examined in both the 1979 and 1987 samples. The frequency of the westslope alleles has decreased at every one of these loci; this change is statistically significant at 3 of the 5 loci. On the average, the frequency of westslope genes in the population has decreased from 30% to 13%. The same trend was found in the other two populations as well.

The simplest explanation of these results is that natural selection is favoring Yellowstone chromosomes in these populations. Steve's results with mtDNA support this interpretation. The frequency of westslope mtDNA is greater than the frequency of westslope proteins in all three populations (see attached Table 3). The increase in frequency of Yellowstone genes is completely unexpected (at least by us), especially because the westslope is the native fish.

Steve also found an association between the gender of fish and their mtDNA type (westslope or Yellowstone). There is a deficit of males with westslope mtDNA in all three populations (see attached Table 3). These results suggest that there may be some genetic incompatibility between westslope mtDNA and Yellowstone nuclear genes.

We would like to be able to continue our work in Fish Lake. It is important to confirm our initial results so that we can begin to understand the dynamics of the genetic changes in these populations. You may recall that we initially requested permission to sample 50 fish. We would ideally like to sample an additional 50 fish this year. However, a sample of 25 fish would also be useful.

The letter from Superintendent Rusk last year requested prior notification of plans to publish this information. We are currently working on a manuscript describing these results that we intend to submit to a peer reviewed journal, probably the journal Genetics.

Best regards,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Fred".

Fred W. Allendorf
Professor of Zoology

Table 1. Length, weight, condition factor, sex, and age of Yellowstone X westslope cutthroat trout collected from Fish Lake, Glacier National Park, 6 September 1988.

| Fish No. | lg (mm) | wt (g) | cf | sex | age |
|----------|---------|--------|------|-----|-----|
| 1 | 431 | 924 | 1.15 | M | 2+ |
| 2 | 420 | 940 | 1.26 | M | 3+ |
| 3 | 445 | 950 | 1.07 | F | 4+ |
| 4 | 417 | 858 | 1.18 | F | 4+ |
| 5 | 401 | 687 | 1.06 | F | 4+ |
| 6 | 376 | 697 | 1.31 | M | 3+ |
| 7 | 369 | 597 | 1.18 | F | 3+ |
| 8 | 368 | 580 | 1.16 | M | 2+ |
| 9 | 352 | 525 | 1.20 | M | 2+ |
| 10 | 368 | 634 | 1.27 | F | 4+ |
| 11 | 375 | 690 | 1.30 | F | 4+ |
| 12 | 377 | 670 | 1.25 | M | 3+ |
| 13 | 356 | 545 | 1.20 | F | 3+ |
| 14 | 362 | 559 | 1.17 | F | 2+ |
| 15 | 357 | 522 | 1.14 | F | 3+ |
| 16 | 354 | 585 | 1.31 | M | 3+ |
| 17 | 368 | 568 | 1.13 | M | 2+ |
| 18 | 346 | 502 | 1.21 | M | 2+ |
| 19 | 320 | 412 | 1.25 | F | 2+ |
| 20 | 328 | 386 | 1.09 | F | 2+ |
| 21 | 291 | 293 | 1.18 | M | 2+ |
| 22 | 296 | 319 | 1.23 | F | 2+ |
| 23 | 282 | 270 | 1.20 | F | 3+ |
| 24 | 282 | 278 | 1.23 | M | 2+ |
| 25 | 275 | 271 | 1.30 | F | 2+ |
| 26 | 270 | 219 | 1.11 | F | 1+ |
| 27 | 246 | 175 | 1.17 | F | 1+ |
| 28 | 229 | 144 | 1.19 | F | 1+ |
| 29 | 214 | 124 | 1.26 | F | 1+ |
| 30 | 212 | 108 | 1.13 | F | 1+ |

Table 2. Allele frequencies in Yellowstone X westslope cutthroat trout collected in 1979 and 1987 from Fish Lake, Glacier National Park.

N = number of fish analyzed

p(ws) = frequency of westslope allele

$\Delta p(ws) = p(ws)(1987) - p(ws)(1983)$

| Locus | 1979 | | 1987 | | $\Delta p(ws)$ |
|---------|------|-------|------|-------|----------------|
| | N | p(ws) | N | p(ws) | |
| Aat1 | 0 | --- | 22 | .227 | --- |
| CkC1 | 0 | --- | 30 | .250 | --- |
| Gpi3 | 31 | .290 | 30 | .100 | -.19** |
| Idh1 | 31 | .387 | 30 | .267 | -.12 |
| Idh4 | 31 | .242 | 30 | .133 | -.11 |
| Lgg | 0 | --- | 30 | .117 | --- |
| Me-1,2 | 31 | .258 | 30 | .083 | -.18* |
| Me3 | 0 | --- | 30 | .150 | --- |
| Me4 | 31 | .306 | 30 | .050 | -.26*** |
| Sdh | 0 | --- | 29 | .034 | --- |
| Average | | .297 | | .127 | |

*P<0.05; **P<0.01; ***P<0.001

Table 3. Nuclear and mtDNA gene frequencies in three hybrid swarms of westslope x Yellowstone cutthroat trout.

$p(ws)$ = mean frequency of westslope nuclear alleles averaged over 10 diagnostic loci

$m(ws)$ = frequency of westslope mtDNA

X^2 is a 2x2 contingency chi-square for independence of mtDNA type versus sex of fish.

df = degrees of freedom for chi-square test

| Collection | N | Gene Frequency | | Number of Fish | | | | χ^2 | df |
|--------------|-----|----------------|-------|----------------|------|----------|------|----------|----|
| | | Nuclear | MtDNA | WS mtDNA | | YS mtDNA | | | |
| | | | | female | male | female | male | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| Cataract Cr. | 58 | 0.41 | 0.53 | 21 | 10 | 12 | 15 | 3.19 | 1 |
| Fish L. | 30 | 0.13 | 0.43 | 10 | 3 | 9 | 8 | 1.82 | 1 |
| Forest L. | 62 | 0.44 | 0.71 | 35 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 5.41* | 1 |
| Total | 150 | --- | --- | 66 | 22 | 30 | 32 | 10.42* | 3 |

* $P < 0.05$